

WIPO General Assembly

**Fortieth (20th Ordinary) Session
Geneva, September 26 to October 5, 2011**

REPORT OF THE SELECTION PANEL FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE WIPO EXTERNAL AUDITOR

prepared by the Selection Panel

1. The present document contains the Report of the Selection Panel for the Appointment of the WIPO External Auditor, which provides an overview of the selection process conducted by the Panel, and the recommendation of the Selection Panel for the appointment of the WIPO External Auditor.

2. The General Assembly is invited to approve the recommendation of the Selection Panel for the Appointment of the WIPO External Auditor, as recorded in paragraphs 13 and 14 of the Selection Panel's Report.

[Report of the Selection Panel follows]

REPORT OF THE SELECTION PANEL FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE WIPO EXTERNAL AUDITOR

Background

1. At the meeting of the Assemblies of the WIPO Member States held in September 2007, it was decided to put a mechanism in place to select and replace the External Auditor at the end of the current mandate (2011). In accordance with that decision, the International Bureau on March 31, 2010 transmitted a Call for Proposals to submit technical and financial proposals for the appointment as External Auditor, to be received by June 30, 2010.

Nomination of Selection Panel

2. In accordance with document WO/PBC/14/5, as amended and approved by the General Assembly of WIPO on October 1, 2009, a Selection Panel was appointed, comprised of the Coordinators of each of the seven Groups of WIPO Member States. The invitation was sent by the Director General to the Permanent Representatives of WIPO Member States acting as the Coordinators of each of the seven Groups of WIPO Member States.

3. The following were appointed as Members of the Panel for the Appointment of the WIPO External Auditor:

Mr. Makiese Kinkela AUGUSTO (Angola)
Mr. Faiyaz Murshid KAZI (Bangladesh)
Ms. Alexandra GRAZIOLI (Switzerland)
Mr. Grega KUMER (Slovenia)
Mr. José Ramón LÓPEZ DE LEÓN IBARRA (Mexico)
Mr. Askhat RYSKULOV (Kyrgyzstan)
Mr. YUAN Yuan (China)

4. The Selection Panel was convened by the International Bureau and met initially in July, on July 7, 8 and 12, 2010. During these sessions, the Panel adopted its Rules of Procedure and chose Mr. José Ramón LÓPEZ DE LEÓN IBARRA as President and Mr. Grega KUMER as Vice-President. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the Director General appointed Mr. Avarð BISHOP, WIPO Chief Ethics Officer, as Secretary to the Selection Panel.

5. Representatives of Finance Services and the Internal Audit and Oversight Division (IAOD) of WIPO, together with WIPO's Independent Advisory Oversight Committee (IAOC), prepared a list of draft selection criteria with appropriate weightings (the evaluation matrix), which was submitted to the Selection Panel for its consideration.

Selection Criteria

6. The selection criteria proposed were those mentioned in the Call for Proposals, as follows:

Independence: demonstrated autonomy from other institutions or bodies of the government; integrity; objectivity in the discharge of duties and responsibilities; and ability to self-determine scope of audit.

Qualifications of Officials and Staff: conformity to the auditing standards of the United Nations Panel of External Auditors and ethics governing their work; professional qualifications, skills, and size of work force; membership in internationally recognized accounting or auditing bodies such as the International Organization of the Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), the International Federation of Accountants (IFAC), etc.; proficiency in English and at least one other official UN language; and knowledge of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS).

Training and experience: existence of a program for continuing professional education for staff; experience in the audit of United Nations organizations or other national or international public sector or non-governmental organizations; staff adequately trained in modern trends of auditing and with extensive audit experience; and experience in auditing Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) systems.

Audit Approach and Strategy: comprehensive work plans to ensure adequate audit coverage of all WIPO resources; performance of financial and compliance audits as well as economy, efficiency and value-for-money audits; and collaboration with WIPO's IAOD to optimize the use of limited audit resources.

Audit Reports: timely communication of audit results presented to management and WIPO bodies through comprehensive management letters and audit reports. The audit reports should be accurate, complete, balanced, fair and constructive.

Cost: the most competitive fees.

Technical evaluation

7. The Panel approved the evaluation matrix to be used for the technical evaluation of the proposals, following which the proposals which had been received by the closing date (June 30, 2010) were opened according to standard procurement procedure.

8. Representatives of Finance Services and IAOD carried out the preliminary technical evaluation which was then reviewed by the IAOC and the results were then communicated to the Selection Panel.

Shortlist

9. Following a review of the results of the technical evaluation, consideration of the review comments of the IAOC, and consultations of the Panel, the Selection Panel agreed on October 27, 2010 upon a shortlist of candidates:

- (a) the Comptroller and Auditor General of India;
- (b) the Office of the Auditor General of Norway; and
- (c) the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.

Oral presentations

10. The three shortlisted candidates were invited to make oral presentations to the Selection Panel, followed by questions from the Panel and answers from the shortlisted candidates. In addition, the candidates were presented with a number of standard questions in advance, which had been prepared by the Selection Panel. The purpose of the oral presentations and question

and answer sessions was to enable Panel members to have a better appreciation of the proposals and to provide an opportunity to seek additional information and clarification in order to facilitate the selection process.

11. The oral presentations occurred on January 10 and 11, 2011. Information from the oral presentations was used as part of the technical evaluation process.

12. The Selection Panel deliberated on its recommendation on January 21 and 28, 2011.

Recommendation

13. On January 28, 2011 the Panel, acting in accordance with article 9 of the Selection Panel Rules, took its decision by voting by secret ballot. The Panel Members have signed the final report of the Panel (attached as Annex). As a result of this vote, it was decided to recommend the highest evaluated candidate, namely the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, to the General Assembly for appointment as WIPO External Auditor, in accordance with the Financial Regulations and Rules of WIPO for a period of six years, to begin in January 2012, following negotiation of a draft contract by the International Bureau with such candidate.

14. The Selection Panel requested the Secretariat to ensure that the draft contract incorporated Annexes I, II, III and IV as attached to the Call for Proposals transmitted March 31, 2010 for the Appointment of the External Auditor of WIPO as well as any agreements reached as part of the negotiations.

[Annex follows]



**SELECTION PANEL FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE
WIPO EXTERNAL AUDITOR**

The Selection Panel for the Appointment of the WIPO External Auditor, following a vote by secret ballot on January 28, 2011 (resulting in five votes for the Comptroller and Auditor General of India and two votes for the National Audit Office of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, all members of the Panel being present) recommends to the WIPO General Assembly the appointment of the highest evaluated candidate:

The Comptroller and Auditor General of India

in accordance of the Financial Regulations and Rules of the World Intellectual Organization, as WIPO External Auditor for a period of six years, to begin January 1, 2012.

.....
Mr. Makiese Kinkela AUGUSTO
(Angola)

.....
Mr. Faiyaz Murshid KAZI
(Bangladesh)

.....
Ms. Alexandra GRAZIOLI
(Switzerland)

.....
Mr. Grega KUMER
(Slovenia)

.....
Mr. José Ramón LÓPEZ DE LEÓN IBARRA,
(Mexico)

.....
Mr. Askhat RYSKULOV
(Kyrgystan)

.....
Mr. YUAN Yuan
(China)



**SELECTION PANEL FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE
WIPO EXTERNAL AUDITOR**

The Selection Panel for the Appointment of the WIPO External Auditor adopted the attached Report of the Selection Panel as of the 11th day of March, 2011:

.....
Mr. Makiese Kinkela AUGUSTO
(Angola)

.....
Mr. Faiyaz Murshid KAZI
(Bangladesh)

.....
Ms. Alexandra GRAZIOLI
(Switzerland)

.....
Mr. Grega KUMER
(Slovenia)

.....
Mr. José Ramón LÓPEZ DE LEÓN IBARRA
(Mexico)

.....
Mr. Askhat RYSKULOV
(Kyrgystan)

.....
Mr. YUAN Yuan
(China)

[End of Annex and of document]